

The University of Western Ontario
Report of the Librarians' and Archivists' Career Trajectory Fund Committee
November 26, 2019: Portion pertaining to 2018-19 salary adjustments

Background and Mandate:

The Librarians' and Archivists' Career Trajectory Committee (L/A CTC) was established by agreement between The University of Western Ontario (the Employer) and The University of Western Ontario Faculty Association (the Association) on behalf of the Librarians and Archivists. A Career Trajectory Fund (CTF) was also established through this agreement. The value of this fund is \$40,000 for the 2018-2019 year. A previous Career Trajectory Fund distributed \$40,000 to members for the 2016-17 year. This report reflects the work of the L/A CTC in fulfilling the mandate of the 2018-2019 Career Trajectory Adjustments. The Committee has now completed its work.

In 2018-2019, Career Trajectory Adjustments are to be assigned first to address any Gender-Based Anomalies for Members with Probationary or Continuing Appointments whose salaries are determined to be anomalously low because of their gender. These adjustments are to be made from the CTF before any Career Trajectory Adjustments are considered. Any remaining funds are to be distributed to Members with Probationary or Continuing Appointments whose salaries are anomalously low relative to their career stage compared to similar Librarians and Archivists at comparator institutions.

In undertaking this work the L/A CTC examined relevant salary data and, following a case-by-case review, has recommended systematic adjustments to salary to be added to a Member's 2018-2019 base salary after all other adjustments (scale, PLCP, etc.) effective July 1, 2018. As the work of the Committee has been delayed, the adjustment will be retroactive to July 1, 2018, and will require adjustments to salaries in subsequent years. The recommendations of the Committee were made to the Provost through the Committee Chair.

Summary of Recommendations:

In the first round of its work, the L/A CTC reviewed relevant salary data and developed a systematic model to predict salaries of Librarians and Archivists at Western. As a result of this work, salaries were adjusted for 22 members retroactive to July 1, 2016. In this second round, the committee applied the systematic model developed in the first round to salaries as of July 1, 2018, with the addition of a gender variable. The committee found no evidence of systematic gender-based anomalies in the pay structure for Western's Librarians and Archivists. The committee then proceeded to review salary information for comparable universities to determine the trajectory of salaries, depending on career stage. The committee first determined what comparators would be used and how it would define career stage. With respect to comparator institutions, we considered using the Bovey 4 universities and also considered using the Ontario Universities who were members of the Canadian Association of Research Libraries (CARL) as comparators. We only had data for 6 of these CARL universities and, given that the Bovey 4 were among those 6, we chose to use librarians and archivists at the 6 Ontario CARL universities as the comparator. For the definition of career stage, the committee used years of a professional experience obtained since receiving the MLIS (or comparable) degree. As a result of this review, 27 members will receive Career Trajectory Adjustments retroactive to July 1, 2018.

2019 Committee Membership:

In accordance with the agreement of the Parties, the L/A CTC consisted of five members, with two appointed by the Association, two appointed by the Employer and a Chair chosen jointly by the Employer and the Association. The Committee membership was:

Chair:

Ann Bigelow (Adjunct Lecturer, DAN Department of Management and Organizational Studies)

Association Appointees:

John Costella (Collections & Content Strategies Librarian, Western Libraries)
Kristin Hoffmann (Research & Scholarly Communication Librarian, Western Libraries)

Employer Appointees:

M. Karen Campbell (Vice-Provost (Academic Planning, Policy & Faculty))
Catherine Steeves (Vice-Provost and Chief Librarian)

Resource Person:

Margaret Poirier, Senior Analyst, Office of the Vice-(Provost Academic Planning, Policy and Faculty)

Deadlines:

On March 28, 2017 the Parties agreed by Letter of Understanding to delay the implementation of the Career Trajectory Fund for 2016-2017. In February 2019, the Parties agreed that as the 2015-2019 Collective Agreement was to expire at the end of June 2019, there could be no further delays in the work of the Committee. As a result, the Committee was struck and started to meet in March 2019.

The Parties agreed that the L/A CTC would carry out its mandate to distribute both pools of Career Trajectory Funds as expeditiously as possible. If required, the Committee's work would continue to completion irrespective of the expiry of the current Collective Agreement or the commencement of collective bargaining between the Parties.

The first round of adjustments was completed in June 2019 and the second and final round of adjustments are now recommended to the Provost in November 2019 for completion before the end of 2019.

L/A CTC Meetings:

The dates of the L/A CTC meetings in the second round of the process were:

June 27, 2019
October 21, 2019
November 11, 2019
November 19, 2019 (Ann Bigelow and Jennifer Robinson, on behalf of Catherine Steeves, met to review results)

The Committee completed its work at the November 11 meeting. Two members of the committee met on November 19 to conduct the case-by-case review.

Process

Adjustments from the 2016-2017 Career Trajectory Fund:

A separate report is available that explains the process followed in the first round of adjustments. This report discusses the process followed in the second round of adjustments to review salaries for Gender-Based Anomalies and further Career Trajectory Adjustments for Probationary and Tenured Members whose salaries are anomalously low relative to their career stage compared to similar Librarians and Archivists at comparator institutions. The adjustments discussed in this report are retroactive to July 1, 2018.

Adjustments from the 2018-2019 Career Trajectory Fund:

The Committee reviewed the 2015-2019 Collective Agreement between the Parties to ensure that the mandate was clear. The agreement between the Parties indicated that the 2018-2019 Career Trajectory Fund was to be used first to correct any salaries for Members with Probationary or Continuing Appointments whose salaries were anomalously low because of their gender.

The Committee used revised salary amounts, taking into account all adjustments resulting from the 2016-2017 Career Trajectory Committee and subsequent salary increases received by Members under the terms of the 2015-2019 Collective Agreement. Using these salary amounts, the Committee undertook a detailed regression analysis of the salary data for Librarians and Archivists in order to define the relationships between an individual's salary and determinant variables related to experience and accomplishment, as well as gender. This study showed no evidence of systematic gender bias in pay structure at Western for Librarians and Archivists.

With the requirement to review salaries for gender-based anomalies addressed, the committee was able to move on to compare the salary structure for Western's Librarians and Archivists to that at comparator institutions. The Committee agreed that comparator institutions were Ontario English-language-only universities that are members of the Canadian Association of Research Libraries. The Committee reviewed available data collected by the Ontario Council of Academic Vice-Presidents (OCAV) and determined that the data required for this comparison were available from 6 comparator universities: Brock, Guelph, McMaster, Queen's, Waterloo, and Windsor. The committee had access to compilations of full-time salary data for all Probationary and Continuing Librarians and Archivists at Western as well as at the 6 comparator institutions.

The committee was able to group Probationary and Continuing Members of the bargaining unit into bands based on years of professional experience obtained since receiving the MLIS (or comparable) degree. The same grouping was done for the comparable positions at the 6 comparator institutions. Mean and median salaries were determined for each grouping. The groupings used were chosen to maintain a consistent mean within the range of years of professional experience. As some numbers of years of professional experience had very few members in them, an additional consideration was ensuring that there were adequate numbers of individuals in each band to allow the calculation of a meaningful mean.

The data revealed that in 2017-2018, for Members with 10 or more years of professional experience since obtaining the MLIS (or comparable) degree, mean salaries at Western were lower than comparator institution salaries in the same year. For Members with fewer than 10 years of professional experience since obtaining the MLIS degree, mean salaries at Western were higher than comparator institution salaries in the same year.

The committee used this data to determine an estimated percentage by which Librarian and Archivist members in a given professional experience cohort were underpaid relative to a typical colleague at a comparator institution.

Adjustments:

Once the groupings and averages were determined for Western and for the comparator institutions, the committee determined the percentage increase required for each cohort of Members. Using these percentages, adjustments were calculated for Members with 10 or more years of professional experience obtained since receiving the MLIS (or comparable) degree. All data were completely anonymous. The initial adjustment calculation corrected for the full difference between the mean at the comparator institutions and the mean for the Western cohort. As the total of these adjustments exceeded the \$40,000 trajectory fund, the Committee prorated the adjustment amounts in order to allocate the entire \$40,000 fund to Members.

Case-by-case review:

The Committee reviewed each individual differential using an anonymous listing that indicated for each Member the total difference between the projected and actual salary and ensured that each individual adjustment appeared reasonable relative to the external comparator cohorts.

In addition, two Committee members reviewed the adjusted salary amounts (salary at July 1, 2018 plus adjustment) using anonymous data. This review was completed by grouping members by rank and comparing the adjusted salaries for members with different average PAI scores, different years of service as a professional librarian, and different years since MLIS. A comparison of current salary to the new salary was also completed. This review was conducted to ensure that the adjustments did not introduce any new internal anomalies. These detailed reviews confirmed that the adjustments were reasonable.

Conclusion:

The recommendations of the Committee were made to the Provost through the Committee Chair. The adjustments are expected to be implemented retroactive to July 1, 2018 on the December 2019 pay.