The University of Western Ontario Report of the Librarians' and Archivists' Career Trajectory Fund Committee July 6, 2023: Portion pertaining to 2022-23 salary adjustments

Background and Mandate:

The Librarians' and Archivists' Career Trajectory Committee (L/A CTC) was established by agreement between The University of Western Ontario (the Employer) and The University of Western Ontario Faculty Association (the Association) on behalf of the Librarians and Archivists. A Career Trajectory Fund (CTF) was also established through this agreement. The value of this fund is \$40,000 for the 2022-23 year. Previous Career Trajectory Funds distributed \$40,000 to members for the 2016-17 year and \$40,000 for the 2018-19 year. This report reflects the work of the L/A CTC in fulfilling the mandate of the 2022-23 Career Trajectory Adjustments. The Committee has now completed its work.

In 2022-23, Career Trajectory Adjustments are to be assigned first to address any Gender-Based Anomalies for Members with Probationary or Continuing Appointments whose salaries are determined to be anomalously low because of their gender. These adjustments are to be made from the CTF before any Career Trajectory Adjustments are considered. Any remaining funds are to be distributed to Members with Probationary or Continuing Appointments whose salaries are anomalously low relative to their experience and accomplishment using factors including, but not limited to, years of service, years since MLIS (or equivalent Archivist qualification), rank, recent PAI scores and career stage compared to similar Librarians and Archivists at comparator institutions.

In undertaking this work the L/A CTC examined relevant salary data and, following a case-bycase review, has recommended systematic adjustments to salary to be added to some Members' 2022-23 base salary after all other adjustments (scale, PLCP, etc.), effective July 1, 2022. As the work of the Committee has been delayed, the adjustments will be retroactive to July 1, 2022, and will require adjustments to salaries in subsequent years. The recommendations of the Committee were made to the Provost through the Committee Chair.

Summary of Recommendations:

The L/A CTC reviewed relevant salary data and developed a systematic model to predict salaries of Librarians and Archivists at Western. The Committee found no evidence of systematic gender-based anomalies in the pay structure for Western's Librarians and Archivists. The Committee then proceeded to review salary information to determine any internal anomalies in salary trajectories, depending upon career stage and performance. A subsequent stage was to review data from comparable universities to determine how Western's Librarians and Archivists salaries' compare to their colleagues at other universities, again depending upon career stage. As a result of this review, 18 members will receive Career Trajectory Adjustments retroactive to July 1, 2022.

2022 Committee Membership:

In accordance with the agreement of the Parties, the L/A CTC consisted of five members, with two appointed by the Association, two appointed by the Employer, and a Chair chosen jointly by the Employer and the Association. The Committee membership was:

Chair:

Laura Stephenson (Professor and Graduate Chair, Political Science)

Association Appointees:

Kristin Hoffmann (Research & Scholarly Communication Librarian, Western Libraries)

Kristi Thompson (Research Data Management Librarian, Western Libraries)

Employer Appointees:

Catherine Steeves (Vice-Provost and Chief Librarian)

Denise Connelly (Associate Vice-Provost, Academic Planning, Policy & Faculty)

Resource Person:

Margaret Poirier, Senior Analyst, Office of the Vice-Provost (Academic Planning, Policy and Faculty)

Deadlines:

The Committee was struck in March 2023 and started to meet in early April 2023.

The Parties agreed that the L/A CTC would carry out its mandate to distribute the Career Trajectory Fund as expeditiously as possible. Although the goal was to provide recommendations for adjustments by the end of June 2023, the Parties agreed to extend the work into July 2023. The final adjustments are now recommended to the Provost for immediate implementation in July 2023.

L/A CTC Meetings:

The dates of the L/A CTC meetings were:

April 4, 2023 April 24, 2023 May 8, 2023 May 26, 2023 June 29, 2023

The Committee completed its work with an email exchange on July 3, 2023 after the June 29 meeting.

Process

Adjustments from the 2019-2023 Career Trajectory Fund:

The Committee reviewed the 2019-2023 Collective Agreement between the Parties to ensure that the mandate was clear. The agreement between the Parties indicated that the 2019-2023 Career Trajectory Fund was to be used first to correct any salaries for Members with Probationary or Continuing Appointments whose salaries were anomalously low because of their gender. After that, remaining funds were to be used to correct anomalies related to internal or external comparisons. The fund total was \$40,000.

The Committee discussed the report of the 2018-19 CTC. That Committee looked at gender, experience and accomplishments in building a model of salaries. For external comparisons, they looked to 6 Ontario Council of Academic Vice-Presidents (OCAV) institutions.

The Committee decided to investigate gender anomalies through a regression of salaries as well as looking at PAI scores by gender and rank to identify bias. In light of the COVID-19 disruptions and potential inequities created by differential responsibilities, the Committee decided to look at average PAI over 5 years. In 2018-19 the CTC used 3-year averages. Marg Poirier was immensely helpful in preparing all of the necessary data and analyses. The Committee thanks her for her hard work.

All members of the bargaining unit as of July 2022 were included in the dataset, regardless of whether they were eligible for an adjustment. The Committee spent considerable time discussing whether anyone should be excluded, and recommends that Clause 20 be clarified in the next round of bargaining. The Committee used base salary amounts, excluding any administrative stipends, as the starting point of analysis. Using these salary amounts, the Committee undertook a detailed regression analysis of the salary data for Librarians and Archivists in order to define the relationships between an individual's salary and variables related to experience and accomplishment, as well as gender. This study showed no evidence of systematic gender bias in pay structure at Western for Librarians and Archivists. The analysis of PAI scores likewise showed no evidence of gender bias. The Committee considered a variety of variables, including rank, years of professional experience, and years since MLIS, before determining their final model of salary structure. Ultimately, the Committee determined that the most appropriate model included just average PAI (5 years) and years of professional experience.

With the requirement to review salaries for gender-based anomalies addressed, the Committee was able to move on to consider internal career trajectory anomalies and external comparisons. The Committee agreed that comparator institutions were Ontario English-language-only universities that are members of the Canadian Association of Research Libraries. The Committee reviewed available data collected by the Ontario Council of Academic Vice-Presidents (OCAV) and determined that the data required (and appropriate in terms of date) for this comparison were available from 5 comparator universities: Brock, Guelph, McMaster, Queen's, and Waterloo. The Committee had access to compilations of full-time salary data for all Probationary and Continuing Librarians and Archivists at Western as well as at the 5 comparator institutions.

The Committee grouped Probationary and Continuing Members of the bargaining unit into cohorts based on years of professional experience. The same grouping was done for comparable positions at the 5 comparator institutions. Mean salaries were determined for each grouping. The Committee discussed using either 5-year or 10-year experience cohorts for comparisons, depending upon availability. The analysis was prepared and in each case, for either 5-year or 10-year cohorts, the ratio of comparative salaries to Western salaries was greater than 1.0. This means that mean salaries at Western were lower than comparator institution salaries in the same year.

Adjustments:

The Committee met when all of the data for determining internal and external adjustments was determined. All data were de-identified. The main point of discussion was about which element should be prioritized for adjustments. The Committee decided that since the goal of the fund was to address anomalies, it would be appropriate to prioritize internal anomalies over external ones. It decided to address only internal anomalies with the funds available (0% external comparison-based adjustments). The Committee decided that this would address current internal inequities in salaries to position a future Committee to distribute Career Trajectory Funds to improve anomalies relative to comparator institutions.

As the total of the adjustments exceeded the \$40,000 trajectory fund, the Committee prorated the adjustment amounts in order to allocate the entire \$40,000 fund to eligible Members.

Case-by-case review:

The Committee reviewed each individual adjusted salary using a de-identified listing that indicated for each Member the total difference between the projected and actual salary and ensured that each individual adjustment appeared reasonable relative to their peers given their experience and PAI. This review was conducted to ensure that the adjustments did not introduce any new internal anomalies. This detailed review confirmed that the adjustments were reasonable.

Conclusion:

The recommendations of the Committee were made to the Provost through the Committee Chair. The adjustments are expected to be implemented retroactive to July 1, 2022 on the July 2023 pay.