## The University of Western Ontario Report of the Librarians' and Archivists' Career Trajectory Fund Committee May 28, 2019: Portion pertaining to 2016-17 salary adjustments

## Background and Mandate:

The Librarians' and Archivists' Career Trajectory Committee (L/A CTC) was established by agreement between The University of Western Ontario (the Employer) and The University of Western Ontario Faculty Association (the Association) on behalf of the Librarians and Archivists. A Career Trajectory Fund was also established through this agreement. The value of this fund is \$40,000 for the 2016-2017 year. There is also an additional \$40,000 to carry out a Gender Based Anomalies Adjustment and Career Trajectory Adjustment in 2018-19. This report reflects the work of the L/A CTC in fulfilling the mandate of the 2016-2017 Career Trajectory Adjustments. The Committee will then continue its work to fulfill the 2018-2019 adjustments once this initial set of salary adjustments is completed. A similar report will follow once the Committee has completed its work with the 2018-19 adjustments.

In 2016-2017 Career Trajectory Adjustments are to be assigned to Members with Probationary or Continuing Appointments whose salaries are anomalously low relative to their experience and accomplishment using factors including, but not limited to, years of service, years since MLIS (or equivalent Archivist qualification), rank, recent PAI scores. In undertaking this work the L/A CTC examined relevant salary data and, following a case-by-case review has recommended systematic adjustments to salary to be added to a Member's 2016-2017 base salary after all other adjustments (scale, PLCP, etc.) effective July 1, 2016. As the work of the Committee has been delayed, the adjustment will be retroactive to July 1, 2016, and will require adjustments to salaries in subsequent years. The recommendations of the Committee were made to the Provost through the Committee Chair.

# Summary of Recommendations:

The L/A CTC reviewed relevant salary data and developed a systematic model to predict salaries of Librarians and Archivists at Western. An anonymous case-by-case review was completed, and systematic adjustments were recommended for 22 members representing 50% of the eligible Members of the Bargaining Unit. For those Members affected, the L/A CTC recommended salary adjustments that range in value from \$286 to \$3,000. These adjustments were made to the 2016-17 salary following the application of the scale increase of 1%, and any Performance-Linked Career Progress increase. There were no residual funds. Adjustments were effective July 1, 2016.

### 2019 Committee Membership:

In accordance with the agreement of the Parties, the L/A CTC consisted of five members, with two appointed by the Association, two appointed by the Employer and a Chair chosen jointly by the Employer and the Association. The Committee membership was:

# Chair:

Ann Bigelow (Lecturer and Director, Graduate Diploma in Accounting, DAN Department of Management and Organizational Studies)

### **Association Appointees:**

John Costella (Collections & Content Strategies Librarian, Western Libraries) Kristin Hoffmann (Research & Scholarly Communication Librarian, Western Libraries)

### **Employer Appointees:**

M. Karen Campbell (Vice-Provost (Academic Planning, Policy & Faculty)) Catherine Steeves (Vice-Provost and Chief Librarian)

#### **Deadlines:**

The Parties agreed that the L/A CTC would carry out its mandate to distribute both pools of Career Trajectory Funds as expeditiously as possible. If required, the Committee's work would continue to completion irrespective of the expiry of the current Collective Agreement or the commencement of collective bargaining between the Parties.

## L/A CTC Meetings:

The dates of the L/A CTC meetings to date were:

March 26, 2019 April 23, 2019 April 29, 2019 April 30, 2019 May 15, 2019 (Catherine Steeves and Ann Bigelow met to review results) May 21, 2019

The Committee completed its work at the April 30 meeting. Two members of the committee met on May 15 to conduct the case-by-case review, and the full committee met again on May 21 to review and edit the final report for the 2016-17 fund.

# Process

### **Delayed implementation:**

On March 28, 2017 the Parties agreed by Letter of Understanding to delay the implementation of the Career Trajectory Fund for 2016-2017. The agreement was to delay until such time as results from an appeal before the Pay Equity Hearings Tribunal were known, or until 30 days after either party gave notice to the other that it no longer agreed to delay, at which time the Career Trajectory Committee would be struck to commence its work. The Decision of the Pay Equity Hearings Tribunal was received by the Parties on November 28, 2018 and the Parties continue to discuss pay equity related issues. In February, 2019, the Parties agreed that as the 2015-2019 Collective Agreement was to expire at the end of June, 2019, there could be no further delays in the work of the Committee. As a result, the Committee was struck and started to meet in March, 2019.

### Initial discussions:

The Committee reviewed the 2015-2019 Collective Agreement between the Parties to ensure that the mandate was clear. Without reviewing any data, the Committee discussed factors that could be considered in developing a model for Librarian and Archivist salaries at Western. The agreement between the Parties indicated that the factors that should be included were factors

including, but not limited to, years of service, years since MLIS (or equivalent Archivist qualification), rank, and PAI scores. The Committee considered two additional factors. One was the existence of a second degree, possibly a degree higher than the MLIS or equivalent; the other was the average PAI over three years.

The Committee discussed which Members should be eligible for a Career Trajectory adjustment. The L/A CTC determined that in order to receive an adjustment an individual had to be a Probationary or Continuing Member of the Bargaining Unit at the time the adjustments were determined. The Committee agreed that this was consistent with the intent of the language in the article *Compensation and Benefits* Clause 19 of the 2015-19 Collective Agreement, which indicates that "Career Trajectory Adjustments shall be assigned to Members with Probationary or Continuing Appointments…"

The subject pool used for the Committee's calculations included all individuals who were Members of the Bargaining Unit on July 1, 2016. The Committee also determined that when considering years of service we would be taking into account years of professional service in the event that any member had worked at Western in a capacity other than as a professional librarian or archivist.

The Committee undertook a detailed regression analysis of the salary data for Librarians and Archivists. The purpose of the regression analysis was to define the relationships between an individual's salary and determinant variables related to experience and accomplishment. The Committee compared regressions with and without information about the existence of a second degree, and determined that this variable did not improve the predictive value of the regression equation. The Committee also compared regressions calculated using the PAI score for the most recent year to regressions with PAI scores calculated using a three-year average. It was determined that the average PAI score provided the best results.

# Adjustments:

A regression using the variables of years of professional service, years since MLIS (or equivalent Archivist qualification), rank, and average PAI scores was used to predict salaries. Predicted salaries were compared to the actual salaries at July 1, 2016 for all Members who continued to be employed at Western at the time of the adjustment calculations. The resulting regression equation had an  $R^2$  of 0.7006, indicating that over 70% of the variance in the 2016 salaries of Librarians and Archivists at Western is explained by the regression equation.

The regression formula was used to generate a projected salary for each individual. All data were completely anonymous. An initial adjustment figure was calculated by comparing the projected and actual salaries as of July 1, 2016 for all Members eligible for an adjustment. For those librarians and archivists with a projected salary higher than their actual salary, an initial adjustment amount was established. The Committee then applied the \$3,000 maximum allowable increase to those with adjustments exceeding that maximum amount. As the total of these adjustments exceeded the \$40,000 trajectory fund, the Committee agreed to apply a uniform percentage to the initial adjustment amount beginning with the smallest adjustment and moving upward until the \$40,000 fund total was reached. This resulted in those with the highest

differentials continuing to receive the maximum amount. The entire \$40,000 fund was allocated to members.

### Case-by-case review:

The Committee reviewed each individual differential using an anonymous listing that indicated for each member the total difference between the projected and actual salary and ensured that each individual adjustment appeared reasonable relative to other Members with similar experience and accomplishment.

In addition, two Committee members reviewed the adjusted salary amounts (salary at July 1, 2016 plus adjustment) using anonymous data. This review was completed by grouping members by rank and comparing the adjusted salaries for members with different average PAI scores, different years of service as a professional librarian, and different years since MLIS. A comparison of current salary to the new salary was also completed. These detailed reviews confirmed that the adjustments were reasonable.

### Conclusion:

The recommendations of the Committee were made to the Provost through the Committee Chair. The adjustments are expected to be implemented retroactive to July 1, 2016 on the June, 2019 pay.